

(1) CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Breen called the regular meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. in the Town Center Historic School House Meeting Room, 765 Portola Road.

(2) ROLL CALL

Planning Director Debbie Pedro called roll:

Present: ASCC: Commissioners Koch, Sill and Wilson; and Vice Chair Breen.  
Absent: Chair Ross  
Planning Commission Liaison: Denise Gilbert  
Town Council Liaison: Maryann Derwin and Ann Wengert  
Town Staff: Planning Director Debbie Pedro and Associate Planner Arly Cassidy

(3) ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

(4) OLD BUSINESS

(a) Architectural Review and Site Development Permit for a New Residence, Pool & Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit, File #38-2016, 480 Westridge Drive, Chen/Honda Residence.

Associate Planner Arly Cassidy presented the staff report regarding this project. She described the plans which were revised in response to the ASCC comments from the December 12, 2016, preliminary review. A comment letter and updated WELO checklist were included in the staff report.

Vice Chair Breen called for questions from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Koch asked if there have been any discussions with the Crouses. The applicant said the neighbors have raised no additional issues, and it was helpful for them all to see the view from their property.

Vice Chair Breen asked if there was any way to soften the light from the second-story outdoor light fixtures. The lighting designer said careful consideration had been made to have the bulb regress slightly into the downlight with a black honeycomb louver placed on top of the bulb, diffusing the light and significantly cutting the glare.

With no additional questions, Vice Chair Breen invited the applicant to comment.

Luca Pignata, project architect, said the design team, in response to the ASCC's suggestion, changed the guest house to an accessory dwelling unit by reducing some of the storage space and adding a kitchen.

Bob Cleaver, landscape architect, said they reduced the scope of planting, netting a little over 2,000 square feet of area that is disturbed by grading, but not irrigated. Additionally, they

changed some of the plants and spaced them out more, resulting in further reduction of water usage.

In response to Vice Chair Breen's question, Mr. Pignata said the plan was for no air conditioning if possible; however, they are considering adding localized units in key locations such as the top of the stairs and the bedrooms. He said the energy calculation has not yet been completed.

With no further questions from the Commissioners, Vice Chair Breen opened the public hearing.

Aisha Gillett, 120 Cervantes Road. She asked regarding the lighting on the stairs. The lighting designer said the fixtures on the stairs were selected because they face downward, are shielded, and are fully dimmable. She said they are there for safety and will be at a low level, just grazing the stairs, and placed symmetrically. Mr. Cleaver said the lights at the front entry stairs are at every riser, but at the pool and between the buildings by the garage to the second unit they are not on every riser. Ms. Gillett said she understands the lights will be small, but expressed concerns over the quantity and asked if there was any compromise to consider. The lighting designer said the scale on the rendering may be a little misleading, and the light fixtures themselves are actually not in the risers, but on the sidewalls, intended to indirectly wash the stairs.

Stephen Gillett, 120 Cervantes Road. He asked regarding the construction staging plan. Mr. Pignata said the general contractor is not yet fully engaged, but he said they should be able to provide staging in a screened area. He said the parking would occur on-site or via shuttles off-site, and there will be no parking on Westridge.

Charles Zaffaroni, Westridge Architectural Supervising Committee. He asked for clarification regarding the amount of grading and net cut shown on the current plans because they were concerned about the amount of traffic that off-haul would create on Westridge. Associate Planner Cassidy clarified that the amount of proposed cut and fill had not changed since the December 12<sup>th</sup> preliminary review; however those amounts exclude the pool and basement cut.

Mr. Zaffaroni said construction staging and the truck traffic need to be considered, especially considering the four or five large-scaled construction projects that will be going on in that area. He said the Committee was also concerned regarding the visual impact and lighting on the second story, although it appeared the louvers discussed today will address those concerns.

With no further public comment, Vice Chair Breen brought the item back to the Commission for discussion.

Commissioner Sill said the project team did a good job addressing the Commission's concerns. He said he was particularly happy about the improvements to the lighting and landscaping. He supports the project.

Commissioner Koch said she was excited to see the project move forward. She was pleased to see the gate moved back and the reduction in lighting. She said that while the entry step lighting is very subtle, the Town usually does not allow two lights on one step. She would like to see some compromise there, perhaps every other side or even in the riser itself. She was very pleased at the 24% reduction in irrigation. She supported the project.

Commissioner Wilson was pleased with the design, the lighting reduction, the irrigation reduction, and the gate being moved back. She was supportive of the project.

Vice Chair Breen said her concerns remain with the lighting at the second story. She would like to see a mockup of the front area in front of the fireplace, up in the ceiling, to see how the lighting works with the louvers. She said there may be too many lights in the pool. She said the meadow and plantings on the hillside coming down the driveway should be protected during construction staging.

The Commissioners were in support of a mockup of the lighting at the framing stage. Mr. Cleaver asked if the step lights could get looked at at the same time. He said they could put a fixture there on-site so the Commissioners could see how it glows. Vice Chair Breen said she is less concerned about the step lights because there is no offsite impact.

Commissioner Sill moved to approve the site development permit with staff's recommended conditions and the added condition that two Commissioners review and approve the second-floor lighting mockup and front step lights before final framing. Seconded by Commissioner Koch, the motion carried 4-0. Commissioner Koch and Vice-Chair Breen volunteered to review the lighting mockup at the time of rough framing inspection.

(5) NEW BUSINESS [7:29 p.m.]

(a) Architectural Review for a Barn Conversion to Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit, File #03-2016, 3330 Alpine Road, Callander Residence

Associate Planner Arly Cassidy presented the staff report regarding the proposed conversion of a 1,045-square-foot barn to a 997-square-foot one-story detached accessory dwelling unit. She described the ambiguity amidst the codes and ordinances regarding what structures are or are not allowed within the scenic corridor setback. In response to Vice Chair Breen's question, Associate Planner Cassidy said the use of the trellis in this project is primarily screening. Planning Director Pedro said to be consistent with past practices structures in setback should be prohibited, but the Commission should determine if this is considered to be an ornamental garden structure or a structure that would require a variance.

Vice Chair Breen invited the applicant to comment. The applicant, Peter Callander, said they have kept their frontage along the scenic corridor as natural as possible, but would like to add lattice work at the parking stall.

Vice Chair Breen called for questions from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Wilson asked about the barn door sliding across the car space at the rear. Mr. Callander said the goal was to have the garage doors be sliding gates that slide to the left to provide an entrance to the cottage. He said the solid panel on the left could be changed to latticework to match the front and be a place for the wisteria.

In response to Commissioner Koch's question, Mr. Callander confirmed that they were trying to achieve a sense of privacy for the second unit and also screen the cars.

With no further questions, Vice Chair Breen opened the public hearing.

Charles Zaffaroni, Westridge Architectural Supervising Committee. He said they have reviewed the proposal and are in general support with comments as provided in their letter in the staff report.

With no additional public comment, Vice Chair Breen brought the item back to the Commission for discussion.

Commissioner Koch was supportive of the project. She was supportive of the existing barn door and the lattice being considered a garden structure. She agreed that the unnecessary light fixtures should be removed.

Commissioner Wilson was supportive of the project. She would prefer to see lattice versus the solid barn door.

Commissioner Sill was supportive of the project. He said he was supportive of the lattice being considered an ornamental garden structure.

Commissioner Wilson said she liked the concept of the barn doors screening the car from the driveway, but would prefer the latticework rather than the solid barn door for the left panel. Mr. Callander said he could remove the solid boards and replace them with open lattice with an evergreen vine. He said on the east elevation, there is lattice with a trellis on top and suggested he could also remove the trellis here so that the only trellis would then be on the south elevation where it actually serves a purpose of holding up the gates.

After some discussion, the Commission agreed that the solid barn doors would better screen the car and give the master bedroom more privacy. Commissioner Wilson also agreed, but said that it would look better aesthetically with more opacity.

Commissioner Koch moved to approve the project with the conditions recommended in the staff report, including the exterior light fixtures to be dark sky compliant, removal of the unnecessary light fixtures, and with retroactive building permits for the existing illegal structure. Seconded by Commissioner Sill; the motion carried 4-0.

Associate Planner Cassidy asked the Commissioners to confirm that structures are prohibited in the scenic corridor setback. The Commission agreed and said the structure in this project is an ornamental garden structure, which is allowed by code to encroach within the setback.

**(b) Preliminary Architectural Review and Site Development Permit for a New Residence, Pool, Teahouse, Accessory Dwelling Unit and Studios, File #37-2016, 228 Westridge Drive, Dolin Residence**

A site visit was held at this property earlier today. Associate Planner Arly Cassidy presented the staff report regarding this proposal for a 5,792-square-foot home with a partial second story and basement, 552 square-foot detached garage, a 614 square-foot detached accessory dwelling unit, a 590 square foot studio, a 165 square-foot teahouse, a 1,239 square-foot pool, and landscaping throughout the 4.38-acre property. She noted the applicant has advised that civil drawings of the studio have been prepared, and they will likely have an approval letter from the Town Geologist shortly. She said, however, there continues to be some concern about the studio. She said there is also concern regarding pushing the massing of the building toward the ravine.

Vice Chair Breen called for questions from the Commission for staff.

With no further questions, Vice Chair Breen invited the applicant to comment. Project Architect Carter Warr thanked the Commission for attending the site visit this afternoon.

Vice Chair Breen called for questions from the Commission for the project team.

Commissioner Koch asked regarding the hobbit door. The applicant, Ron Dolin, said it was for fun.

Commissioner Sill asked regarding the use of the studio. Mr. Dolin advised that the studio will be used by his wife for repairing rare books and by himself to work with programmable LED lights. Commissioner Sill asked if the studio would require air conditioning or special climate control. Mr. Dolin said downstairs in the main residence is where the books will be stored and that will require climate control; however, he said the studio will not. Commissioner Sill asked why there were two paths. Mr. Dolin said they will be dirt trails used for meditative walks. He said there is a lot of space on his property that he would like to access. Mr. Warr said if they add lighting to the paths, it will be user-activated and should not be visible offsite.

Vice Chair Breen asked where the air conditioning units will be placed. Mr. Warr said they will plan for air conditioning units on the uphill side of the garage, but they are not yet sure that air conditioning will be installed.

In response to Vice Chair Breen's question, Mr. Warr said the pool equipment will be downstairs adjacent to the bathroom.

Vice Chair Breen said while there is not a lot of offsite impact, she asked if they will be using a special kind of glass since there are three stories of glass and one big glass room. Mr. Warr advised that glass treatments are only marginally effective. He stated that the house was carefully sited and designed to specifically capture the views and use the existing plant material. He said the story poles have been up since June, and they have received no comments. He said there will likely be some generational planting although he doesn't think there is a need for a lot of additional planting. He said a small amount of planting will be done for the guest house.

With no further questions from the Commission, Vice Chair Breen invited public comment.

Charles Zaffaroni, Westridge Architectural Supervising Committee. He said they conducted a preliminary site visit recently, and he reviewed their findings as detailed in their letter included in the staff packet.

Aisha Gillett offered support for the circular trail design proposed for the property.

With no additional comments from the public, Vice Chair Breen closed the public hearing and brought the item back to the Commission for discussion.

Commissioner Koch said this is a truly unique home in an inspiring, creative space. She was supportive of the colors and materials. She was supportive of the siting and said it will be spectacular after the tree removal and the opening up of the views. She said she is concerned that there is no area for cars to turn around before they reach the driveway gate. Mr. Dolin said he understands the issue of delivery drivers having to back down the driveway if they cannot get past the gate and will give that some additional thought.

Commissioner Koch said she loves the idea of the foot trails, but she does not want to see the hillside lit up with path lighting, even it is only user activated. Mr. Dolin said the dark sky is one of the reasons he moved here, and he expected some discussion on this issue, but would want the footpaths whether they are lit or not.

Commissioner Wilson said she liked the home's S shape, and her favorite element of the project is the teahouse. She said the planned planting of the manzanita is excessive, and they will not do well being so crowded.

Commissioner Koch said she used to own the adjoining property. She said she is concerned about screening between the two properties if the owners of the adjoining property do not install some plantings there to eventually replace the eucalyptus.

Commissioner Wilson said she was uncomfortable that the project was at the maximum square footage allowed for the property. She said in large houses, people tend to not use as much of it as they think they will. Mr. Dolin said he has a blended family – he has his son half the time, his wife has two children, and they have imagined having an exchange student. He said this house is designed for a blended family to take advantage of the spaces.

Commissioner Sill offered support for the siting of the proposed residence and the minimal landscaping. He said he is okay with the proposed studio, but would also appreciate less development on the site. . He was supportive of the materials palette, but said there was a little too much stone for his personal preference. He supported the footpath provided that it is not lit.

Vice Chair Breen said she was concerned about people having to back out of the driveway onto the street. She said the applicants need to come up with another configuration, perhaps moving the gate to the first turnout. She is interested in seeing the interior lighting plan. She supports the lower driveway. She would prefer to see the one pathway going down through the pasture eliminated, but she understands the intention and said it is a lovely concept. She said if there is a path, however, it should be less developed and not have bender board siding or any lighting. She said she is thrilled at the planned tree removal and said the tree by the pool is fabulous. She said there are two Japanese maples that they might consider removing to better showcase that tree. She hoped they would remove all the Acacias down the hill and the dead Dodonaea inside the fence along the street. She supported retention of the existing fence along Westridge. She said she thinks there is too much stone, but acknowledged that is the owner's preference. She said the Dr. Hurd Manzanitas will not survive near the eucalyptus. Mr. Warr said they will discuss it with the landscape architect. She was supportive of the limited landscaping.

**(c) Preliminary Review for Modifications to Previously Approved Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit, Driveway, and Landscaping, File #06-2014, 120 Cervantes Road, Gillett Residence**

Planning Director Debbie Pedro said the ASCC had a field meeting this afternoon at the site. She presented the staff report regarding the proposed changes to the previously approved project. She said the modifications included moving the second unit near to the barn, reducing the size of the barn, and reducing the size of the swimming pool. She noted that the driveway that was previously approved by the ASCC has now also been approved by the Westridge Association. She advised that the driveway location has been modified so that it will run through the parcel previously owned by Cal Water, but which is now owned by the applicant.

Vice Chair Breen called for questions from the Commission for staff. Hearing none, she invited the applicant to comment.

The owner, Stephen Gillett, said they have worked with the neighbors to make sure their design is not incompatible with the neighbors' new designs and will continue to keep those communications going.

With no questions from the Commission, Vice Chair Breen invited public comment.

Charles Zaffaroni, Westridge Architectural Site Committee. He said with the driveway issues resolved, the Committee had no other issues.

With no additional public comment, Vice Chair Breen brought the item back to the Commission for discussion.

Commissioner Wilson was supportive of the project.

Commissioner Koch was supportive of the project. She suggested eliminating the proposed coast live oaks in the trail easement. She said the Cervantes fence line does not seem to have changed that much. She said she understands the preference for a more organic design instead of hedging. She asked if the fence orientation was changing due to the vegetation and slopes or because it is easier to build a straight fence. Aisha Gillett said the Cervantes fence has a lot of elevation change, and the fence naturally meanders a little bit around the plants that are there, but it will barely be seen because it is below Cervantes. Commissioner Koch said she sees no issue with the orientation of the fence.

Commissioner Sill was supportive of the placement of the second unit and appreciated that it is screened by the remnants of the barn. He said it all looks good.

Vice Chair Breen said she is thrilled about the driveway and that they will enter the property through the oak forest. She said she is concerned, however, about vehicles having to back out onto Westridge when they are unable to enter through the gate. Mr. Warr said they could easily add a turnout. Vice Chair Breen said the entrance is wonderful, and they don't need to do any landscaping up to the guest house. She said a native bent grass meadow would look artificial at the corner. She said at the top of the driveway there are four Photinia that should be removed. She said there should be islands of plantings rather than making it look hedgy. Vice Chair Breen advised that if there is going to be lighting associated with the barn, the ASCC should review it. Ms. Gillett asked if there was a better suggestion for the meadow grass because it's really the only flat area on her property for a play area. She said they will take it out if necessary, but was hoping to provide a neighborhood play area. Vice Chair Breen said that kind of meadow grass looks more like a lawn and would be better inside the property rather than on that corner. Mr. Gillett asked if they would be able to change plantings after their house is built. Planning Director Pedro said after the house is finalized, they can make changes themselves unless they are removing significant trees. If they change their mind before the property is finalized, they encourage the applicants to come in and show the changes to staff.

Mr. Warr, in summary, said they will bring additional information for the lighting in the barn, adjust the planting plan, reduce the planting in the front, and add the ability to turn around in the driveway before the gate.

(6) COMMISSION AND STAFF REPORTS: [9:09 p.m.]

Planning Director Pedro said some of the plan sheets and some pages are missing from the minutes. She said the minutes will be brought to the next meeting for approval.

Planning Director Pedro announced that the annual League of California Cities Planning Commissioner Academy will be held in Los Angeles from Wednesday, March 1, through Friday,

March 3. She said the Town has budgeted money for up to three Commissioners to attend and will pay for the registration and accommodations, if anyone is interested.

(7) APPROVAL OF MINUTES: December 16, 2016. Postponed due to missing pages in the staff report.

(8) ADJOURNMENT [9:13 p.m.]