

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Ross called the regular meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. in the Town Center Historic School House Meeting Room, 765 Portola Road.

Interim Planning Director Arly Cassidy called roll:

Present: ASCC: Commissioners Breen and Wilson, Vice Chair Sill, Chair Ross  
Absent: Commissioner Koch  
Planning Commission Liaison: Craig Taylor  
Town Council Liaison: Mary Ann Derwin  
Town Staff: Interim Planning Director Arly Cassidy

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

None.

**NEW BUSINESS**

**(1) Architectural Review for an Addition and Remodel, 155 Grove Drive, Reimund Residence, File # PLAN ARCH 44-2017**

Interim Planning Director Cassidy described the proposed 604-square-foot addition and 285-square-foot kitchen remodel to an existing home on a 1.25-acre property located at 155 Grove Drive. Staff recommended the ASCC approve the project subject to the Conditions of Approval, as detailed in the staff report.

Darci Reimund, owner, pointed out that the conversion of the barn was completed a few years ago and the last addition/remodel was the den and front door.

Interim Planning Director Cassidy said the plans distributed to staff mistakenly show one area as having a wood treatment that will actually be stone and the plans have been corrected.

Interim Planning Director Cassidy pointed out the barn sconces, one of which is proposed over a window. She said this architectural element was approved in the past for this house and matches existing approved light fixtures in other gables, but does not conform to the Town's guidelines on lighting, which recommends lighting only at exterior doors. Staff requested direction from the ASCC on whether this light fixture should be allowed. Interim Planning Director Cassidy said Commissioner Koch stated via email that she supported the project, but asked for a closer look at the lighting.

Ms. Reimund said they bought the house in October 2009. She said they have been working off the master floor plan that they started in November 2009. She said all of the lighting selected is the same as what was on the plan since 2009. Ms. Reimund said she has run an architecture interior design firm for 18 years, serving the Peninsula and Northern California, as well as projects in Florida. She said her goal is to create a project that embraces the spirit of Portola Valley, using reclaimed barn siding from two barns they bought – one from Minnesota and one from Wisconsin. She said they had the barns dismantled, re-milled, and shipped to them. She

said they wanted the house to grow over time, similar to how historical farmhouses grew as family needs changed. She said the corrugated roof material they used has very low reflectivity value, and they are one of the first people in the United States to use this particular material. She said they tried to keep the lighting as minimal as possible. She said there is little exterior maintenance required on the house except the eaves. She said the landscaping work they've done on the property conforms to when they added the barn, and the neighbors are supportive and satisfied.

Chair Ross invited questions from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Breen asked if the light fixture in question was dark-sky compliant. Interim Planning Director Cassidy said the bulb is above the 180-degree plane, and the glass feature captures and reflects some light, but it does not technically contradict dark-sky compliance. She said a person would have to be directly below the fixture to see the source of light. Ms. Reimund said when they went through the barn conversion approval process, the ASCC requested this particular light which led to changing all the lights on the rest of the house.

In response to Commissioner Wilson's question, Ms. Reimund said the glass is frosted.

Chair Ross asked why the sconce was being placed over a window. Ms. Reimund said it provides an architecturally-pleasing wall-washing, provides needed path lighting around the house, and is more characteristic of the American barn farmhouse. She said the light on the north elevation will light the patio, the stairs, and the stone. She said the same fixture is on every other gable on the entire house.

With no further questions, Chair Ross invited public comment. Hearing none, Chair Ross brought the item back to the Commission for discussion.

Commissioner Wilson said she drove past the residence today and stopped at the top of the driveway because of her concern about the lights, especially the one over the window. She said she parked at Stonegate and could see one galvanized light as she walked around. She also noted that the gate is solid wood, and all the other driveways do not have solid gates. Ms. Reimund said the gate is 61 feet into her property and is in conformance. Commissioner Wilson suggested less lighting on the pathways and the elimination of the light above the kitchen window. Ms. Reimund said the pathway is behind the garage, and the three lights are at steps down to the guest cottage that they rent to a person who works in town. She said they have already taken out one of the lights, and there is no other lighting going down that pathway. She said the fourth light shown in the plans would be better served as one of the low step lights. Commissioner Wilson said there should be less lighting in general.

Commissioner Breen was in full support of the project and the colors and the materials. She said she understands the sconce being a design element of the property and supports it since the light fits up inside. She asked if the skylights will be covered at night. Ms. Reimund said no light was in the skylight or shining into it. Commissioner Breen was supportive of the path lighting. She said the nonconforming suspended lights down the driveway should be removed and replaced with additional path lights. Ms. Reimund agreed, but said she was told at some point she could not do that.

Commissioner Sill was supportive of the project. He said he was supportive of the light over the window.

Chair Ross was supportive of the project. He agreed with Commissioner Breen's request to replace the driveway suspended lights with pathway lights. Ms. Reimund said she was happy to do that and would like to use the same pathway lights down the driveway as she's using on the rest of the property. Commissioner Breen suggested a member of the Commission review that plan because they do not want an airport look down the driveway. Ms. Reimund said it's quite dangerous walking down the driveway, which is 61 feet long, and they would need a minimum of four lights.

Chair Ross suggested more than one switch for the exterior lights. Ms. Reimund agreed. Chair Ross said that the orientation of the patio and kitchen window will help minimize any visual impact from the road. He said he prefers the clear glass because the frosted glass has a greater sense of illumination. Ms. Reimund asked if she could change them to clear glass. Chair Ross said he would be supportive of that. Interim Planning Director Cassidy said the current Design Guidelines described frosted glass as shielding an exposed bare bulb. She said it could be argued that this bulb is shielded as far as dark-sky compliance. She said the Design Guidelines are currently under review and will likely be changing. She said from the dark-sky compliance point of view, the main idea is that the bulb itself is never farther below a flat plane than the shield, and she believes this light meets that guideline. The Commission was supportive of the applicants request to use clear glass.

Interim Planning Director Cassidy said that if a specific number of path lights are added in addition to what are on the current plans, they should be placed behind the gate. Ms. Reimund said the driveway is quite long, and they had the lights in the tree because a lot of cars cannot be parked on the driveway, so instead guests park on the street and walk down the very dark driveway. She requested a few lights on the driveway that she can turn on as people are leaving. Commissioner Breen said she could support two lights outside the gate.

Commissioner Breen moved to approve the proposed addition and remodel at 155 Grove Drive as submitted, with the option of changing out the frosted glass to clear glass, with the current suspended driveway lights removed, and with a comprehensive lighting plan to come back to an individual member of the ASCC for review. Seconded by Vice Chair Sill; the motion carried 3-1 with Commissioner Wilson voting nay.

**(2) Architectural Review for an Addition and Remodel, 171 Trinity Lane, Allen/Corwin Residence, File # PLAN ARCH 45-2017**

Interim Planning Director Cassidy described the proposed 560-square-foot addition and approximately 140-square-foot remodel to an existing home on a 1.2-acre property located at 171 Trinity Lane. She noted the property had a ground movement map modification approved by the Planning Commission a few months ago, allowing the house and property additional floor area. Staff recommended the ASCC approve the project subject to the Conditions of Approval, as detailed in the staff report.

Chair Ross invited questions from the Commission.

Vice Chair Sill said the staff report indicates the building is not getting any higher, but it appears the proposed roof is approximately 6 feet higher than the original. Interim Planning Director Cassidy said she may have missed that and asked the applicant and architect if the top of the roof was higher. The applicant confirmed that the roof line was proposed to extend higher. Vice Chair Sill said it looks like the proposed roof height is probably 29 feet as indicated, and it is not a problem, but the previous roof height was lower.

Chair Ross invited comments from the applicant. The owner said they have lived there 1-1/2 years and need a second bathroom and a larger kitchen. He said they have tried to keep within the requirements of the neighborhood.

Chair Ross invited questions from the Commissioners. Hearing none, he invited public comment.

Craig Taylor, 111 Santa Maria. Mr. Taylor expressed support for his neighbor's project. He said the other neighbors are also supportive of the project. He said they will need to make sure that only small concrete trucks come down that road and that parking during construction does not block access to the neighbors. He suggested the two lights at the front door not be on motion sensors. Hearing no other public comment, Chair Ross brought the item back to the Commission for discussion.

Vice Chair Sill was supportive of the well thought out addition which will be a big improvement to the house. He was supportive of the two lights at the back deck, but said there should not be two lights at the front entry.

Commissioner Breen was supportive of the project. She suggested that if the two lights at the front door were there for symmetry, only one should be operable. Commissioner Breen agreed that construction staging will be important.

Commissioner Wilson was supportive of the project. She agreed with the two lights at the back deck, but only one at the front door. She was appreciative of a property being renovated rather than torn down and rebuilt.

Chair Ross agreed the proposal was well thought out and fit the existing house and property very well. He agreed there should only be one operable light at the front entryway. He said construction logistics is always an issue in that area. The applicant said they have discussed the issue with neighbors on both sides of them.

Commissioner Wilson moved to approve the proposed addition/remodel at 171 Trinity Lane with only one operable light at the front door. Seconded by Vice Chair Sill; the motion carried 4-0.

## **COMMISSION, STAFF, COMMITTEE REPORTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **(3) Annual Election of ASCC Chair and Vice Chair**

Interim Planning Director Cassidy said Commissioner Koch indicated willingness to serve in a position at an earlier meeting.

Chair Ross said he was not interested in either position.

Vice Chair Sill said he would be interested in the Vice Chair or Chair position.

Commissioner Breen said she was ambivalent, but would be happy to Vice Chair if necessary.

Commissioner Wilson said she was ambivalent.

Commissioner Breen nominated Al Sill as Chair. Vice Chair Sill nominated Megan Koch as Vice Chair.

The vote was 4-0 to elect Al Sill as Chair and Megan Koch as Vice Chair of the ASCC.

Town Council Liaison Derwin asked regarding the threshold for missing meetings. Chair Ross said missing 25 percent is grounds for dismissal by the Council if the Council so chooses. He said there was a concern two or three years ago about Commissioner Koch's attendance rate; however, it has improved in the last couple of years and is no longer an issue.

Planning Commission Liaison Taylor said he has attended a number of ASCC meetings and Chair Ross has been a fabulous Chair. He congratulated him on his service.

**(4) News Digest: Planning Issues of the Day**

Interim Planning Director Cassidy shared articles with the Commission regarding container homes and placemaking. She invited the Commission to suggest or share other interesting articles with her for inclusion in future staff packets.

Commissioner Breen suggested everyone attend the housing meeting coming up on March 3. Interim Planning Director Cassidy said staff is asking for RSVPs for people interested in attending. She said the meeting is from 10:00 to 12:00 p.m. She said the idea is to welcome anyone with curiosity around the issue of housing.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**(5) ASCC Meeting of January 22, 2018**

Commissioner Wilson moved to approve the January 22, 2018, minutes as submitted. Seconded by Chair Sill, the motion passed 2-0, with Commissioners Ross and Breen abstaining.

Commissioner Wilson said someone commented to her there was a lot of lighting at a house at the end of Nathhorst.

Commissioner Breen said a house on Westridge is still lit up, and she thought it had been handled, approximately three houses down on the right. She added that the house next to it has the trees uplighted.

Commissioner Breen asked Commissioner Wilson why she voted nay on Item 1 and asked if, procedurally, that should have been explored more. Commissioner Wilson said the General Plan said lights are not allowed above windows and specified frosted lighting. Commissioner Breen said that had to do with lantern fixtures where the bulb is exposed. Commissioner Wilson asked when more information would be coming from staff about lighting. Interim Planning Director Cassidy said it will be at the next meeting.

Commissioner Breen said Mr. Taylor commented negatively about motion sensor lights; however, the Town is moving more in the direction of motion sensor lights. Chair Sill said the motion sensors should not reach off the property. He said Mr. Taylor described exactly what the Town does not want, where walking along the road turns on everyone's motion sensor lights. Interim Planning Director Cassidy said this needs to be discussed at the next meeting because it is not agendaized for this meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT [8:02 p.m.]**