

**CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Breen called the special teleconference meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Planning & Building Director Laura Russell called roll:

Present: ASCC: Commissioners Megan Koch, Al Sill, and Jane Wilson; Vice Chair Dave Ross; Chair Danna Breen.  
Absent: None  
Town Council Liaison: Craig Hughes  
Town Staff: Planning & Building Director Laura Russell; Assistant Planner Dylan Parker

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

None.

**NEW BUSINESS**

**(1) Architectural Review of a new 2-car attached garage with 368 SF art studio above, 4 Portola Green Circle, Nordgren, File #PLN ARCH08-2020**

Assistant Planner Parker described the project, the background, and staff's analysis and recommendation as detailed in the staff report. Staff recommended the ASCC review the plans and staff report, offer feedback or additional conditions of approval, and approve the proposed project subject to the recommended conditions of approval.

Staff noted there are four gooseneck light fixtures proposed and not two, as indicated in the staff report.

Chair Breen invited questions from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Koch asked how the Town deals with the prefab hot tub/spas that do not indicate the lighting source. Assistant Planner Parker said they could require the applicant to provide manufacturer's information or they could require an additional control for the lighting upon installation of the spa. The applicant could be required to select a unit that has minimal lighting to conform to Town policy. He said a standalone spa would not necessarily require a Planning permit. Vice Chair Ross suggested submitting the manufacturer's literature that provides lighting information.

Commissioner Wilson asked if the garage door is solid wood or includes glass. Assistant Planner Parker, and project architect Emily Jagoda confirmed, that the garage door is all wood.

Commissioner Sill said there did not appear to be story poles. Assistant Planner Parker said he elected to not require story poles based on the nuanced language of the PUD and that the attached garage does not have a net effect on the footprint or the size of the main residence.

Chair Breen asked if, because this is a PUD, any reviewing body had looked at or commented on the project. Assistant Planner Parker said his understanding is they did review and approve

the project prior to submittal.

Vice Chair Ross asked if the skylights over the studio will be visible from a neighbor.

Ms. Jagoda said the skylights are on the second story and are not facing the street. She said there is a large tree on the neighbor's property that provides screening, and there is also a shallow dormer. She said the skylights and dormer windows have interior shades.

Commissioner Wilson asked if the AC unit is enclosed. Ms. Jagoda said the AC unit is behind the driveway and behind the building as approached from the street and within a screened enclosure.

With no additional questions from Commissioners, Chair Breen invited public comment.

Leslie Krauss said it is an exciting, creative project. She said there is a semi-road that feeds into the existing driveway leading to the existing garage. In response to her question, staff confirmed that the fire department access is not blocked and remains available.

With no additional public comments, Chair Breen brought the item back to the Commission for discussion.

Vice Chair Ross was supportive of the well-executed design.

Commissioner Koch said this is a great alternative to creating an intimate space with a spa where the existing driveway and garage was and adding an artist studio. She was supportive of the material choices and roof height. Any nonconforming dark-sky compliant lighting needs to be corrected. She said the native planting looks good. She was supportive of the project.

Commissioner Sill agreed that the space in the yard is used more effectively and will provide a more livable space. He was supportive of the project.

Commissioner Wilson said it is a creative use of the existing space. She appreciated keeping heights, impervious surfaces, and lighting below the maximum. She was supportive of the project.

Chair Breen agreed with the other Commissioners that it is a smart project that makes a lot of sense. She said she did notice the string lighting out over the terrace and hopes it's only used at Christmastime. She saw newly planted olive trees and hoped they are non-fruiting because they are very invasive. She said if they are fruiting, the trees should be treated to get rid of the olives. She was supportive of the project.

Commissioner Koch moved to approve the project with staff's recommended conditions. Seconded by Commissioner Sill; the motion carried 5-0.

## **COMMISSION, STAFF, COMMITTEE REPORTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **(2) Commission Reports**

None.

### **(3) Staff Report**

Planning & Building Director Russell thanked everyone for their support while she was out on leave.

Planning & Building Director Russell reported that staff had received an appeal for the project at 138 Goya, and the appeal will be brought to the Planning Commission for their consideration.

Planning & Building Director Russell said that as full services return they are assessing their needs and have retained an additional contract Planner to assist. Jake Garcia will continue on for a few hours a week, and an additional contract Planner, Kavitha Kumar, will be joining the staff to help.

Commissioner Wilson asked how long an appeal process takes. Planning & Building Director Russell said there are code restrictions for maximum times, but they don't anticipate it taking the maximum. She said she and Assistant Planner Parker will be working together with Planning Commission Chair Hasko to get that Planning Commission meeting scheduled as soon as possible.

Commissioner Wilson asked if staff had heard from the Westridge HOA regarding their legal status. Planning & Building Director Russell will check with the Town Manager and report back.

Vice Chair Ross said he was contacted by Dennis Starkovitch, 31 Valley Oak, who has been interacting with Town staff and the PV Ranch architectural committee and landscaping group over the course of the last couple of years regarding concerns about a project by his neighbor at 29 Valley Oak. Vice Chair Ross said he does not recall seeing the project come through the ASCC. He said there are some aspects that don't seem to fit with what would normally be approved. He said the roofing material is a brilliant white terpolymer fabric material that laps over the fascia, creating a bright white trim feature around the top of the fascia all around the house. It appears the specs for the roofing material that was presented to the Ranch for approval indicated a grayish-tan color. Vice Chair Ross said that is one example of a few of Mr. Starkovitch's concerns.

Commissioner Koch said she pulled up Google Maps, and the roof appears to be white. Vice Chair Ross said there are at least three levels of roof, and two have gravel so are not very visible. The highest roof will receive solar panels, and the solar company does not want gravel under it. The biggest concern is the white trim band around the fascia board.

Planning & Building Director Russell said when PV Ranch originally approved the house designs, approvals used to be valid over time, and applicants had a vested right to construct their original designs. The applicants had proposed some revisions to their original approved plans. When Commissioner Sill was ASCC Chair, he and Planning & Building Director Russell reviewed the proposed revisions and determined they were an improvement over the previously-approved plans and decided a full ASCC review was not required. The applicants had a vested right to build to the old plans, but their revisions were a welcomed improvement. She said staff has had ongoing communications with the neighbor and property owner on a regular basis for many months. She said they are trying to address the neighbor's concerns as they come up throughout the process. She said the roof color and how it drapes over the fascia is a new issue to her, and she will address it.

Commissioner Koch said she could see the white roof from Sweet Springs trail. Chair Breen said she looked at their landscape plan last week and is aware of the swale where it would be unsuccessful to plant anything, but everything else was okay. Vice Chair Ross said there are

almost no opportunities for screening on the new construction site because the house is very close to the swale. He suggested to Mr. Starkovitch that the best opportunity for screening would be to plant things on his own property. He said Mr. Starkovitch is concerned he is making enemies with the Town and the Ranch for being so persistent about things, but he is only becoming aware of these things as they occur instead of having input in the early part of the process. Mr. Starkovitch attended some Ranch meetings, but there is no real enforcement mechanism. Vice Chair Ross asked how a situation such as this gets handled.

Planning & Building Director Russell said they will definitely follow up on the fascia trim issue. She said they will continue to work with Mr. Starkovitch, who is certainly not considered to be an enemy, but rather an active participant in the process. She noted that Mr. Starkovitch has hired his own experts in numerous fields for his own review of this project. Vice Chair Ross said that Mr. Starkovitch is in the construction industry and has several concerns about the construction in general, but Vice Chair Ross advised him he may have no recourse for items that do not directly affect him and his property.

Planning & Building Director Russell said it is a lesson learned for staff, as well, in that they would be much more strict about how long applicants would have vested rights for a phased project because new construction should reflect current community expectations.

Vice Chair Ross asked if there is a Planning baseline for an approved project and how the monitoring takes place. Planning & Building Director Russell said they've been reviewing the numerous requests for changes as they come in, some of which have been denied because they are not consistent with previous approvals or are too big of a change. She said the applicant has found the submittal requirements to be quite strict, and staff is trying to be reasonable. She said the Commission's points are well taken that there was not the initial public review process at the beginning, which was 25 years ago.

Commissioner Sill said his recollection is that the new plans were better, being slightly smaller and slightly lower than what was initially approved.

Commissioner Wilson asked if the Commissioners can recycle the photocopied building plans they are reviewing or if they are considered confidential. Planning & Building Director Russell said they can be recycled.

#### **(4) News Digest: Planning Issues of the Day**

Staff shared an article of interest with the Commissioners – “Another Defeat for Statewide Zoning Reform in California.”

#### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

#### **(5) ASCC Meeting of August 4, 2020**

Commissioner Wilson moved to approve the August 24, 2020, minutes as amended. Seconded by Vice Chair Ross, the motion passed 5-0.

#### **ADJOURNMENT [4:51 p.m.]**