

**ARCHITECTURAL AND SITE CONTROL COMMISSION** **September 14, 2015**  
**Special ASCC Site Meeting, 177 Goya Road, Preliminary Architectural Review for New Residence, Detached Garage with Attached Gym and Second Story Studio, Swimming Pool, and Site Development Permit X9H-691**

Chair Ross called the special site meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

**Roll Call:**

ASCC: Breen, Clark, Harrell, Koch, Ross  
ASCC absent: None  
Planning Commission Liaison: None.  
Town Council Liaison: None  
Town Staff: Town Planner Pedro, Assistant Planner Borck

**Others present relative to the proposal for 177 Goya Road:**

Bruce Wright, project architect  
Mickey Mazerac, project architect  
Stephan Thuilot, project landscape architect  
Eric Friedman, General Contractor  
Tobias Holden, project lighting consultant  
Matthew Landl, project lighting consultant  
John Donahoe, applicant  
Eileen Donahoe, applicant  
Dieter Walz, Conservation Committee  
Rusty Day, Westridge HOA  
Gary Nielsen, 148 Pinon Drive

Ms. Borck presented the September 14, 2015 staff report on this preliminary review of the proposed new residence and site improvements. She advised that the project will involve 560 cubic yards of grading that counts towards the site development permit and that the ASCC is the approving body on the permit. She stated that the proposed redevelopment will utilize the existing building pad and driveway entrance. She advised that the home's "L" shaped layout, with groupings of living areas connected by long hallways, provides variation in the elevations and heights and helps to reduce potential massing. She stated that the current plans reflected numerous modifications in response to HOA concerns over potential lightspill and glazing impacts. She noted that written comments had been received from Mr. Bill Crown at 100 La Sandra, who expressed concerns over lightspill, and from Mr. and Mrs. Robert Cheney, 158 Goya Road, who offered support for the project. Ms. Borck advised that the project complies with all floor area, setback, and height limits, and that the maximum height of the new house is 23 feet and the maximum height of the garage/studio is 24'2".

Ms. Borck stated that five eucalyptus trees were proposed for removal along the driveway and autocourt. She advised that the arborist report identified the presence of wood rat nests, and that the Conservation Committee advised that the nests should be allowed to remain as the dusky-footed wood rat is a species of concern in the Santa Cruz Mountains. She also noted that Conservation Committee advised that beyond the building pad, intact native plant communities and some well-established older native plantings exist and should incur minimal disturbance. Ms. Borck stated that the planting zones around the perimeter of the proposed improvements appear to generally comply with the committee's recommendation.

John Donahoe, applicant, offered the background to the design development. He stated that he sought not only to capture the views of the western hillsides and create an indoor/outdoor living experience, but to also respect the site and retain the native plant habitat.

Bruce Wright, project architect, presented renderings and plans to discuss the layout of the new structures, as well as the function and form of the spaces. He explained the revisions that had been made to the plans in response to HOA and neighbor concerns. He provided photo simulations of potential lightspill from the home and how it would look when utilizing various mitigation methods.

In response to questions, Mr. Wright clarified that:

- The exterior aluminum track screens will be in a dark bronze and manually operated.
- The roof deck at the studio is 18' deep and the roof deck at the guest rooms is 9.5' deep.
- The lighting on the home is exclusively down lighting.
- The only sconces are located at the front of the garage.

Matt Landl, lighting consultant, discussed the exterior and interior lighting fixtures and how they are designed to minimize glare and lightspill. He explained that the light source is recessed six inches into the fixture which directs light only downward.

Stephan Thuilot, project landscape architect, reviewed the proposed planting design, tree removals, and screen planting strategy. He advised that the green roof on the home would be meadow grasses. In response to questions, he stated that the seasonal water feature could be designed to capture roof water and that the stainless steel patterned wall was along the exterior stairs on the garage structure.

The project team then led the commissioners through the site and explained the story poles. Commissioner Breen noted that the existing plant communities on site were an incredible representation of a pristine ecosystem.

While viewing the story poles for the garage/studio, Mr. Wright advised that the plate height at the second story was nine feet. He also discussed how the second story over the main house was offset from the eastern elevation of the lower level in order to create less visual impact when viewed from Goya Road.

Gary Nielsen, 148 Pinon Drive, offered appreciation for the efforts to reduce lightspill, as this is his primary concern.

Commissioner Clark inquired if the redwood on the existing home's ceiling would be reused. Mr. Wright advised that the house would be deconstructed and materials would be salvaged.

In response to a question, Mr. Thuilot advised that the Ipe decking with properly applied sealants was very durable and could last up to 20 years.

Dieter Walz, Conservation Committee, offered his support for removal of the eucalyptus and the cedar tree. He asked what was planned for the existing fertile olive tree, and suggested it could be removed and sold.

ASCC members agreed that they would offer comments on the proposal at the regular evening ASCC meeting. Thereafter, project consideration was continued to the regular evening ASCC meeting.

### **Adjournment**

The special site meeting was adjourned at approximately 5:12 p.m.

(1) CALL TO ORDER

Chair Ross called the regular meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. in the Town Center Historic School House Meeting Room, 765 Portola Road.

(2) ROLL CALL

Acting Town Manager Pedro called roll:

Present: ASCC: Breen, Clark, Harrell, Ross, Koch  
Absent: None  
Planning Commission Liaison: Von Feldt  
Town Council Liaison: Derwin  
Town Staff: Interim Town Manager Debbie Pedro, Assistant Planner Carol Borck

(3) ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

(4) OLD BUSINESS

(a) **Architectural Review and Site Development Permit for a New Residence, Detached Second Unit, Barn Remodel, and Swimming Pool, File #s: 49-2014 and X9H-684, 207 Westridge Drive, Mitic Residence**

Assistant Planner Borck presented the staff report requesting ASCC action regarding the architectural review plans for the proposed new residence project. Staff also requested the ASCC provide a recommendation on the proposed grading and site development permit that will be forwarded to the Planning Commission for their consideration on September 16, 2015. The proposed 1,485 cubic yards of grading includes 1,180 cubic yards of cut and 305 cubic yards of fill.

In response to ASCC comments at the preliminary review meeting, Westridge HOA comments, and voluntary revisions, the applicant submitted plans which incorporated numerous changes as described in the staff report.

Chair Ross invited comments from the applicant.

Regarding Condition #3 specifying “no parking on Westridge Drive shall be permitted,” the project architect, Chris Kurrle, said he had previously discussed this with the Public Works Director and received verbal permission to use the pull-off area along Westridge Drive for supplemental parking. Ms. Pedro clarified that the condition refers to parking on the pavement of the road that would obstruct vehicular traffic and that parking off the pavement, with the Public Works Director’s approval, would be permitted.

Mr. Kurrle corrected a statement he made at the last meeting and advised they are now proposing to have lights within the two water features.

Chair Ross invited questions from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Koch asked if the meadow plantings surrounding and below the pool had been adjusted. Mr. Kurrle said the planting plan is designed to capture all the areas where they think there will be construction impacts and disturbance. Within planting Zone 2, after plantings are established, he said the meadow will be maintained with mowing.

In response to Commissioner Clark's question, Ms. Borck said six eucalyptus trees would be removed and three would be kept.

Commissioner Breen suggested clearing as much dead foliage as possible out of the quadrant located to the right of the driveway due to the potential fire hazard.

Chair Ross asked if the applicant had any comments regarding keeping the landscape bridges in the plan. Mr. Kurrle advised that the bridges will afford the applicants full access to the site and a way for the children to explore the property more easily.

Chair Ross invited comments from the public.

Rusty Day, Westridge Architectural Supervising Committee (WASC) President, said the revisions have not been thoroughly reviewed by the WASC yet; however, he pointed out that WASC does not allow parking on Westridge Drive or on the easements on either side of the street. He also said the amount of soil export will require 100 to 150 dirt haul trucks traveling on Westridge Drive. He urged the ASCC to rethink their position about reuse of soils on-site to reduce the potential impacts to roads and traffic from dirt off-haul activity. He supported a meeting between the WASC and the Town to discuss policy for on-site and off-site disposal of soils.

With no other public comments, Chair Ross closed the public hearing and brought the item back to the Commission for comment and action.

Commissioner Breen expressed appreciation of the applicant's responsiveness and was supportive of the changes. She said the parking plan remains problematic.

Commissioner Clark advised that the Public Works Director typically allowed overflow construction parking at Ford Field and that the construction staging plan should be developed to anticipate the need for off-site parking and shuttling. With regard to grading, Commissioner Clark said the only area where on-site excavation could be disposed would be at the location where the pavilion was originally proposed. He encouraged removal of the remaining three eucalyptus trees at the street. Commissioner Clark was supportive of the landscape bridges, suggesting that the delineated path at the bridge leading to the Stanford Wedge be eliminated.

Commissioner Koch was supportive of the changes made, including the removal of the eucalyptus trees, the bay trees, and the pavilion. With regard to the parking on Westridge Drive, she said the option of using Ford Field should be investigated further. She said she supports the excavation and off-haul of the soil.

Vice Chair Harrell was supportive of the landscape bridges, the off-haul of the dirt, and the removal of all of the eucalyptus.

Chair Ross expressed appreciation for the changes made and supported the project. He advised the applicant to consult with the WASC and the Public Works Director regarding construction logistics. He said the best place for soil disposal on-site would be at the abandoned

end of the existing driveway and advised that any possible reduction of off-haul would be appreciated by the neighborhood. In general, Chair Ross suggested the Town and the various HOAs establish harmonious guidelines regarding disposal of soils. He was supportive of not removing the additional three eucalyptus trees at this point. He supported the landscape bridges and thought a garden at the other end would be an appropriate destination for one of the bridges. While not suggesting it be a condition of approval, Chair Ross asked the applicant to consider reduction and separate switching of the lighting at the trash enclosure area.

Commissioner Koch moved to approve the project with the conditions as stated in the staff report and the suggestion that the lighting at the trash enclosure be reduced. Vice Chair Harrell seconded the motion, and the motion carried 5-0.

Chair Ross moved to recommend the proposed grading/site development permit to the Planning Commission. Seconded by Vice Chair Harrell, the motion carried 5-0.

(5) NEW BUSINESS

(a) Architectural Review for a Detached Second Unit and House Addition and Remodeling, File #s: 15-2015, 290 Mapache Drive, Paine Residence

Assistant Planner Borck presented the staff report for the proposed new 750 square foot detached second unit and 72 square foot house addition on the 2.5-acre property. She said the new second unit would be located in the area of the existing horse corral and will be a modern barn design. As a result of the proposed modifications to the existing garage/second unit, Ms. Borck said it will no longer be considered a second unit. She said the proposed project will reduce the site's impervious surface from the current legal non-conforming 22,462 square feet to 16,289 square feet, which is significantly closer to the 12,618 square foot limit for the property. She said she was recently advised that the WASC is in the process of reviewing the project. She said the applicant has requested that the ASCC consider and provide comment without action regarding a possible larger design scheme to take advantage of the upcoming change to the Zoning Ordinance which will allow a 1,000 square foot second unit on the subject site.

Project architect, Jim Stoecker, advised that the barn was demolished in April so that they could accurately locate the proposed second unit. He explained the design of the proposed 750 square foot second unit and how the 1,000 square foot design would be accomplished. He advised that construction parking could be contained on-site, and the site would be accessed from the existing dirt path into the corral.

Chair Ross called for questions from the Commissioners.

Commissioner Breen asked if any landscape lighting was proposed. Mr. Stoecker said the lighting under the overhang was sufficient and path lights were unnecessary. Commissioner Breen advised the applicant that any existing non-conforming lighting on the structures and site will need to be removed with the project.

Chair Ross inquired about the restoration of the compacted soil in the corral. Mr. Stoecker advised that the area would need to be graded, scarified, and amended with clean soil.

With no further questions, Chair Ross called for comments or questions from the public.

Bill Dewes, WASC Secretary, said he visited the property, and noted that the corral restoration will improve site drainage. He said he was satisfied with Mr. Stoecker's responses to the WASC's questions regarding construction staging and potential light spill.

With no other public comments, Chair Ross closed the public hearing and brought the project back to the Commissioners for comment.

Vice Chair Harrell was supportive of the second unit's size increase to 1,000 square feet after the ordinance change in October. She was supportive of the skylight material choices and the material colors.

Commissioner Koch was supportive of the project.

Commissioner Clark asked for procedure clarification regarding the ASCC approval condition that the applicant be allowed to increase the second unit to 1,000 square feet. Ms. Pedro said staff was not asking for a specific condition to allow that to occur, but was asking for the ASCC's comments regarding staff review of the proposed area increase. Ms. Pedro said, for example, if the request was to enclose the porch, which would add 179 square feet, staff could approve it instead of the ASCC. Commissioner Clark said he was not comfortable adding specific language as a condition specifically to this issue; however, he said he supported the application to be expanded to 1,000 square feet, at a later date under staff and designated member review.

Commissioner Breen said she supported the project at 750 or 1,000 square feet. She supported the choice of skylight material. She suggested the pines, pistache, and maples that are growing up into the blue oak canopy at the right of the driveway be removed.

Chair Ross supported the project and the increase to 1,000 square feet subject to staff review. He advised that if staff was uncomfortable with the scope of change, a designated ASCC member could assist in the review. He supported the choice of materials, including the translucent skylight.

Commissioner Clark moved to approve the application as submitted with staff conditions. Seconded by Vice Chair Harrell; the motion passed 5-0.

**(b) Preliminary Architectural Review and Site Development Permit for a New Residence, Detached Garage with Attached Studio and Gym, and Swimming Pool, File #s: 09-2015 and X9H-691, 177 Goya Road, Donahoe Residence**

Chair Ross reported that the ASCC had a field meeting today regarding this project and this was a continuation of that session.

Assistant Planner Borck presented the staff report regarding the project. The ASCC visited the site today and reviewed the story poles for the proposed new residence and the existing conditions with the project team. She said that it appears that significant efforts have been made to reduce the home's potential massing and glazing impacts, as well as to minimize site disturbance and preserve the natural slopes and existing vegetation. However, she said that in pulling the improvements back away from the edge of the hillside and shifting the two guestrooms to a second story on the east side of the home, there is some concern regarding the visual prominence of the structure as viewed from Goya Road. She said lighting has been eliminated along the proposed driveway and reduced along the courtyard area. In response to

potential massing and glazing concerns from the WASC, she stated that three olives and two ginkgo biloba trees were proposed to help screen the west elevation of the home. She advised the ASCC to consider and provide comments on the proposed screen trees. She said the ASCC received written comments from the Crowns, 100 La Sandra, concerning potential glazing and light spill impacts, and noted that a letter of support from the Cheneys, who live directly across the street from the project at 158 Goya, had been submitted.

Chair Ross invited comments from the applicant.

Bruce Wright, project architect, presented a drone video to show what is visible to the home's second story at the roof ridge elevation. He also offered to share samples of the proposed glazing system proposed for the southwest elevation of the home, as well as a number of examples of the proposed down-lighting system. He also shared a 3-D video model of the structure's massing and site layout.

Chair Ross called for questions from the Commissioners.

In response to Vice Chair Harrell's question, Mr. Wright said the roof would be gray to dark gray gravel. In response to her question regarding the type of glass used, Mr. Wright said they are currently contemplating Solar Band 70, a PPG product. She asked the size of the front screen trees at the time of planting, and Mr. Wright advised that they would be 36-inch boxes.

Commissioner Clark asked how the applicant arrived at a finish floor height and if they had considered a lower finish floor height. Mr. Wright said they added 6 inches to the existing finish floor height to accommodate any underground mechanical connections and avoid a deep excavation and more off-haul and grading.

Commissioner Koch asked if the existing fruiting olive was to be transplanted. Stephan Thuilot, project landscape architect, advised that although the landscape plans show the olive transplanted on the western hillside that it will not be and may be removed from the site.

With no further questions, Chair Ross invited comments or questions from the public.

Paul Heiple, Conservation Committee, said they visited the site in July and were quite impressed. He urged the applicant to take care to preserve the wonderful existing native habitat.

Rusty Day said that the WASC is appreciative of the applicant's responsiveness to their concerns. He said that the WASC was hoping to see daylight reflection and nighttime lightspill simulations that focus on the potential impacts of the proposed glazing from the perspective of the neighbors along Pinon Drive and La Sandra Way. He said the WASC is committed to guiding and supporting project designs that are subordinate to the topography of the building site. He pointed out that the southwest elevation of the proposed project overlooks, and is seen by, 11 homes along Pinon and La Sandra. He expressed WASC's concern about the potential impact of the glass walls along the southern face of the proposed home. He said shades are not considered a mitigation measure for reflectivity and light spill because they are owner-controlled. He said that planting screening trees will not likely be successful on the hillside. He suggested a glass mockup be created on site for review. He said WASC welcomes the new owners and are pleased with the collaboration in addressing these concerns. He said the addition of the second story increases the prominence of the structure on the ridgeline, increases the lightspill, and exacerbates the reflectivity. He suggested other alternatives be considered to mitigate the massing, e.g., putting the garage underground, eliminating the



interior courtyard to reduce the footprint, and moving the second story to another part of the property.

With no additional public comment, Chair Ross closed the public hearing and called for comments and recommendations from the Commissioners.

Vice Chair Harrell was supportive of the site design. She said fenestration and natural light are essential and was supportive of the glass material selection. She said the proposed 7-foot overhangs were generous and would help mitigate glazing reflectivity. She was supportive of the lighting design and the care taken to prevent light spill. She offered support for the courtyard design and how it served to reduce massing and break up glazing. She expressed support for the overall design and said the applicants displayed thoughtful consideration of the neighbors and the site. She suggested they consider European rolling screens on a solar timer for the south elevation glazing.

Commissioner Breen expressed appreciation for the presentation by the lighting consultants at the field meeting. She said before the demolition of the existing house, she would like to have a photo record submitted to the Town. She commended the applicants for engaging all the neighbors and being very inclusive in the process. She advised the applicants that anything done to disturb the site would invite invasives. She is not supportive of putting trees in the chaparral on the southwest hillside. She expressed support for the courtyard as an important element to the house. She supported the idea of pulling the house back from the hillside, giving the family space a more intimate experience; however, she advised that the site lends itself to a single-family home and that a design solution should be sought to bring the two guest bedrooms back to the main level of the house. She did, however, support the second story over the garage area. She was supportive of the proposed glazing and the use of the exterior sliding screens to reduce potential reflection and lightspill. She supported the proposed hardscape plan and that no fencing or gates were proposed. She said she would prefer no landscaping around the perimeter of the improvements, leaving the site in its natural, native state, with planting focused primarily in the courtyard. She advised that blue oaks were more appropriate along the street frontage instead of the proposed live oaks. She suggested removing all the eucalyptus at the front of the property except for the one at the telephone pole and the two at the driveway. She said the proposed plant pallet will be severely grazed by deer. To protect courtyard planting, she suggested that the edge of the courtyard be fenced, using railing at the patio. She suggested only one pool light, located at the stairs into the pool, is needed. She offered support for the colors and materials.

Commissioner Clark expressed his appreciation for the applicant's efforts in the process. He said he would support removal of all five eucalyptus and the one cedar. He does not support tree planting on the southwest hillside. With regard to the WASC's concerns about the glazing, Commissioner Clark suggested it may be appropriate to bring up the sill height to reduce the amount of glass surface reflection. He said there may be value in lowering the finish floor throughout the whole of the development which would reduce the appearance of the massing. He agreed with Commissioner Breen that a photo record should be made of the existing residence prior to demolition and suggested the applicants consider reusing some of the redwood in their project.

Commissioner Koch was supportive of the architectural design. She said she understood the second story design solution, but wondered if the glazing at the second level could be broken up and reduced. She said she would like to see renderings of the studio and home's second level elevations to better understand the glazing and wall design. She advised that any disturbance of

the southwest hillside will invite invasives, and she did not support any planting in that area. She did support to the two ginkos on the southwest deck. She agreed with Commissioner Breen that the perimeters of the improvements should remain natural, without landscaping, and that one light would be appropriate in the pool. She agreed that the eucalyptus and cedar should be removed.

Chair Ross supported the architectural and site design and advised that the development was sensitive and responsive to the ridge-top site. He said that a one-story solution would be preferred. He was not supportive of tree planting for screening anywhere on the site and did not support planting any live oaks. He was supportive of lowering the entire house, but said he was sensitive to the issue of cut versus fill and the potential off-haul associated with lowering the house. With regard to the glazing reflectivity and light spill, he said the interior lighting plan is the most thoughtful he has seen. He was supportive of the glass selection and did not believe the proposed project would produce more reflection or lightspill than the existing residence. He said that altering the sill height of the glazing would not offer any substantial benefit. He supported minimal lighting in the pool. He advised it is crucial to fence off the pristine native area beyond the development perimeter to prevent disturbance during construction.

Commissioner Breen added that dittrichia has grown in the area that was disturbed by the recent septic work and needs to be removed immediately. She said the area should be seeded with California native grass seed now in order to restore the area. She suggested eliminating all planting in Zones 1, 2, and most of 4. Mr. Thuilot advised they would not disturb any of the pristine native habitat. He said, however, there were some disturbed areas under the pool that are completely unplanted and need to be addressed. He said amending the zones may be possible, but did not agree at this time with eliminating them. Commissioner Breen noted that the areas inside the driveway and under the pool require restoration, and it should be consistent with the chaparral planting.

Commissioner Clark clarified that raising the sill height of the glazing would reduce heat gain and daytime reflectivity. Vice Chair Harrell agreed and noted that raising the sill height 10"-18" would help increase the occupants' focus on the view versus the patio.

(6) COMMISSION AND STAFF REPORTS:

Ms. Pedro reported that the Town Council approved the roof-mounted solar ordinance and the second unit ordinance on September 9, 2015, and they will become effective on October 9, 2015.

Ms. Pedro confirmed that there will be a quorum for the ASCC meeting scheduled for September 28, 2015. It was agreed that Commissioner Breen will chair the meeting.

Vice Chair Harrell announced this will be her last ASCC meeting as she is moving to Santa Rosa. The Commission thanked Vice Chair Harrell for her service. Vice Chair Harrell expressed her pleasure serving on the commission.

Chair Ross said he reviewed and approved minor changes to the project at 140 Campo.

(7) APPROVAL OF MINUTES: August 10, 2015. Commissioner Breen moved to approve the August 10, 2015, minutes as submitted. Seconded by Commissioner Koch, the motion passed 5-0.

(8) ADJOURNMENT [9:36 p.m.]